Book Reviews

A. David-Neel, Magic and Mystery in Tibet (London, Allen & Unwin, 1984), 224 pp.

One can question reviewing a surprisingly clumsy though extremely popular translation of a book first issued in England in 1931. The only thing really new about it is the suppression of Professor d'Arsonval's original short preface, and its replacement by one from Aaron Sussman, the editor and advertising manager for the first American edition.

The new preface is a bit misleading. It implies that the change of title, originally With Mystics and Magicians in Tibet, was somehow involved with improving originally poor book sales. However, the English edition with that title, far from being "packed off to limbo," was frequently reprinted, even going into a number of Penguin Books reissues.

The first editions were the best. If one can find them on the second hand market, they are surely preferable. That first American edition published by Claude Kendall has much to recommend it. Not only is it easier on the eyes, but it includes, as this edition does not, 15 valuable though fuzzy pictures. These pictures have not been reprinted in Librairie Plon's 1979 edition of photographs, titled *Le Tibet d'Alexandra David-Néel*.

A question to answer is the value for serious Tibetologists of this admittedly popular presentation. Evidently, many Tibetan terms suffer from peculiar transcriptions. A scholar's edition ought to include an index plus a correct glossary. On the other hand, ADN has carefully defined every term she uses. She does not pretend to be more than an involved and sympathetic reporter, one who has done her best to make a study in depth.

She succeeds in her efforts to give not only newcomers to Tibetan and Buddhist studies an insight into "psychic phenomena" as viewed by many Tibetans. Young students especially can be grateful that the popularity of her book has enabled them to find, at a moderate price, a wide ranging and essentially accurate picture of what was going on.

Whether or not one believes in the validity of the "magic" does not affect the interest in a study of its practices. A purely scholarly approach to this study is far less likely to be available at a reasonable price. Moreover,

ADN's treatment of personalities and the social mulch add elements of significant value often missed in more pretentious publications.

The uses of enchantment were treated by Bruno Bettelheim to justify the fairy tale, once a part of every child's first reading. He noted how it enabled children to have strength in a hope to overcome what seemed, and probably were, not just solvable problems, but enduring, permanent difficulties. Bettelheim did not adequately explore the continuing value of such enchantments. In this world of unresolvable troubles, they evidently also help many adults to cope.

Alexandra David-Neel views this area of studies with honesty, insight, and sympathy. She has made contributions of value for a wide gamut of specialists, the linguists, social scientists, medical specialists, folklorists, art enthusiasts and comparative religion investigators. While she stresses events implying mystic interpretations, she doesn't neglect alternate explanations. She gives details as they related to the actual lives of real and interesting people. Her story of Dawasandup is not just interesting. She sees that guns and faith seem stronger than either alone. She notes her Tibetan studies, but frequently admits her need to resort to interpreters.

For those who have for one reason or another not yet read her books and articles, this is surely a good one with which to begin.

Braham Norwick New York City

Karma-pa VIII Mi-bskyod-rdo-rje, et al., ed., (Translated by the Nalanda Translation Committee under the direction of Chögyam Trungpa), *The Rain of Wisdom: The Essence of the Ocean of True Meaning* (Boulder, Shambhala Press, 1980), xxiii + 384 pp.

The Rain of Wisdom is the first major translation project completed by a group of Chögyam Trungpa Rinpoche's American disciples, the Nālandā Translation Committee. Known generally by the abbreviated title Ocean of Songs of the Bka'-brgyud (Bka'-brgyud mgur-mtsho), The Rain of Wisdom is one of a very small number of published Tibetan compilations that may be properly described as poetry anthologies. (Another is the Śańs-pa bka'-brgyud mgur-mtsho compiled by 'Jam-mgon Kon-sprul Blo-grosmtha'-yas, 1813-1899.) The relative discouragement of secular poetry and the standard practice of issuing complete editions of the collected poems of particular religious writers (i.e. the mgur-bums) perhaps account for the comparatively poor development of this genre in Tibet, despite the copious production of anthologies in India and China, the nations which most influenced Tibetan literature. Edited originally by Karma-pa VIII Mi-bskyod-rdo-rje (1507-1554), The Rain of Wisdom has grown with additional contributions by successive generations of Bka'-brgyud-pa masters. In its present

form it embodies the quintessence of the Bka'-brgyud tradition of Buddhist verse practiced from the 11th century down to the present day, as represented by the work of some 35 poets. The English translation should thus interest students of the Buddhist religion as well as of traditional Asian literatures.

It is evident that the Nālandā Committee has made every effort to produce a translation that represents the original text to a very high degree of accuracy, but which also is written in an easy and natural English style, eschewing the cramped conventions which render much translation from Tibetan virtually inaccessible to all but the most patient of readers. An example is in order. These extracts come from "The Song of Könchok Yenlak" (pp. 49-53):

He saw that all the petty goals and activities of oneself and others, and the circumstances of happiness and misery in all places and times were like a swirling illusion or dream . . . Therefore, the experience of things as they are was born in him like summer heat—unfabricated, innate, ordinary, free of fixation, free of bondage, free of liberation. He summed this up as an oral instruction for his worthy disciples, and when he intended to teach, he sang this vajra song . . .

When I was young, I attended spiritual friends, But now that my youth is past, my goal is accomplished.

I pedantically analyzed the texts again and again, But when experience arose in my being, I saw the main point.

I have corruptly lived off the donations to my guru, But this turned into a multitude of virtue completely freeing myself and others.

I have had constant companionship for a long time, But they have now become permanent spiritual friends.

A comparison of select passages with the Rum-btegs xylographic edition of the text reveals only minor faults, mostly with respect to the interpretation of some more or less obscure terms and idiomatic expressions, e.g.:

For Nālandā:

... without being consumed by obstacles. (p. 7)

Read "certainly" Tib. gdon mi za bar]

For Nälandā:

The Buddha, the Victorious One, also taught his sons the dharma of the Avataṃsaka from the Āryasamantabhadracaryāpraṇidhānarāja. (p. 7)

Read:

[As is said] in the Jinaputrasamantabhadracaryāpranidhānarāja ("The Kingly Prayer of Conduct of the Victorious One's Son Samantabhadra"), which is numbered among the doctrines of the Buddhāvatamsaka [Tib. sans rgyas phal po che'i chos kyi rnam grans rgyal sras kun tu bzan po'i spyod pa'i smon lam gyi rgyal po las.]

For Nālandā:

The higher and higher virtues of the path arise effortlessly . . . (p. 9)

Read:

The virtues of higher and higher paths arise effortlessly [Tib. lam gon ma gon ma'i you tan 'bad med du skye].

This refers, incidentally, to the familiar Abhidharmic doctrine of five paths, which is adhered to by the Vajrayāna schools as well.

For Nālandā:

 \dots the minds of the faithful gathering of listeners are transformed into dharma. (p. 9)

Read:

... the faithful gathering of listeners too (finds that) appearance (i.e. one's vision of reality) turns to (i.e. inclines towards) the dharma [Tib. dad 'dus ñan pa po rnams kyan snan ba chos su bsgyur pa].

For Nālandā:

. . . a way of exposing his faults. (p. 91)

Read:

... a way of rebuking his own faults [Tib. ran mtshans sun byin gyi tshul].

For Nalanda:

inconceivable compassion (p. 91)

Read:

unqualified compassion [Tib. dmigs med kyi snin rje].

Dmigs med in this case refers to the subject's exercise of compassion being unqualified by any objective referrent beyond the very exercise of that compassion (dmigs pa de las med pa).

That problems more severe than these are virtually absent attests, I think, to the overall excellence of the translation.

Tibetan religious poetry is, of course, a translator's nightmare. It is expressive of a system of values, a *Weltanschauung*, which is far distant from that in which the contemporary Western reader has been nurtured. Its conventions are alien, its formal characteristics incapable of straightforward transposition into modern English. The Nālandā translators have approached their task as Western Buddhists, who have partially adopted the value-system of the poets they are translating. In order to introduce their readers to the world of their poets, they have appended to their translation an informative afterword (pp. 293-333), which introduces the spiritual milieu of the poems, and which provides much valuable data regarding the text and the identities of the poets themselves. A detailed glossary (pp. 340-376) is also appended.

Concerning the afterword, a few remarks on the section entitled The Lineage and Its Teachings (pp. 293-303) are perhaps in order here. These pages represent, to all intents and purposes, the popular style of teaching Tibetan Buddhism for which Chögyam Trungpa is well known. While I do not wish to question either the insights underlying this approach, or its applicability to the requirements of interested Westerners who are not specialists in Tibetan Buddhist Studies, it may be somewhat misleading here. For example, the description of the Kagyü path follows, in points of detail, the program of Trungpa Rinpoche's Dharmadhatu centers rather than traditional accounts. Thus, it is asserted that "[t]he first step is samatha meditation . . . the first stage of hinayana practice" (p. 296). Certainly this applies to Trungpa Rinpoche's students and a great many other Western Buddhists too. But it does not accurately reflect the sequence of study and practice undertaken by neophytes in a traditional setting. Does this small exercise in pedagogical expedience really matter in the present context? To see that it does, consider that the poets anthologized here represent their hinayana background not with reference to samatha and vipasyana, but with their frequent allusions to the main themes of actual hinavana study in Tibet: impermanence, suffering, moral causation and the discipline of the prātimoksa.

The Kagyü poetic tradition is rightly traced by the translators back to the dohā tradition of the Indian Mahāsiddhas (p. 300). There are, however, at least two other traditions of verse composition from which they drew, namely, the indigenous Tibetan traditions of folksong, verse oratory and bardic chant, and the verse translations of Sanskrit formal poetry and śāstraic verse. The full relation of the Kagyü poets to their cultural and educational background unfortunately has not been explored here, as well it might have been. For to have done so would to some extent have revealed the manner in which these wonderful poets give expression not only to the enlightenment of a specific spiritual tradition, but also to an intricate nexus of not particularly religious cultural values, and to the cultivated erudition of a uniquely Tibetan style of formal scholastic education.

The glossary, though generally quite useful, does occasionally substitute Trungpaesque definitions for traditional ones. E.g., maitrī (byams-pa) is defined as "friendliness to oneself, the prerequisite for compassion for others" (p. 355), in flat opposition to the standard definition, which is "the attitude which desires that all sentient beings have happiness and the causes thereof" (sems can thams cad bde ba dan bde ba'i rgyu dan ldan par 'dod pa'i sems). Another example is found under "grasping and fixation" (p. 349), where the explanation is tailored to support this altogether eccentric translation of the phase gzun ba dan 'dzin pa, which simply means "apprehended (object) and apprehending (subject)."

These points aside, I must reaffirm that *The Rain of Wisdom* is a fine contribution to the body of Tibetan literature in translation. Delightful to read, it evidences also some of the potential for scholarly work that is to be found in the group of disciples who have gathered around Chögyam Trungpa. As the Nālandā Translation Committee's first, it bodes well for their future undertakings and merits this Tibetan characterization: *thog mar dge ba*.

Matthew Kapstein Brown University

A.W. Macdonald, ed., Les Royaumes de l'Himalaya (Paris, Imprimerie Nationale, 1982), 250 pp., plates.

This volume, which is the first in the oriental collection of the French National Press on the history and civilisation of Central Asia, sets out a cultural history of four of the Himalayan Kingdoms, namely Ladakh, Nepal, Sikkim and Bhutan.

With the exception of a general introduction and the notable section on the Limbu of Nepal by Phillipe Sagant, the sources are secondary and the method, if not the viewpoint, essentially archaeological and archival. The editor himself is of the view, which perhaps applies to all matters of cultural history and reconstruction, that the general task is premature and our knowledge a definite patchwork.

Ladakh and Sikkim are today part of the State of India. Nepal and Bhutan still have an independent existence; the first has Hinduism and the second Mahāyāna Buddhism as state religion; these are the two great religions that in part define the traditional civilisations of the area.

In the introduction MacDonald moves from general features of topography and ecology of the Himalayan region to the sequence of settlement of the peoples, seen as from valley to hillside. He sketches the general movement of ethnic groups, that is of indo-aryan speakers from west to east in the 'middle-hills', who have a rice-based economy, and Tibetan-speaking

peoples southwards. Here he provides an overview of a vast and fragmented literature, one that dates at least from Hodgson's writings in the *Journal of the Asiatic Society of Bengal* in 1847, up to and beyond the more recent reconstructions, such as those of S.K. Chatterji (1950) in the same periodical.

He outlines the contrasts not just between the two religious cultures per se, Hindu and Buddhist, but also the mode of action of the two states, India and China ("La Chine s'impose; l'Inde s'infiltre"), and of their two institutionalised religious forms, the Brahmanical and monastic. There is also a social history of monasteries in India, followed by a section on the growth of Buddhism as revealed in art and sculpture, and a socio-political history of Tibet. The broad scope and clarity of this introduction more than make up for any theoretical or particular factual criticism that many, including MacDonald, could make. This is a valuable introduction, not just to this book but to the field as a whole.

The section by Sagant is a first-hand account of the life of the Limbu, a people of eastern Nepal who, like many others, have a legend of descent from kings. The inclusion of this ethnography of traditional local organisation and the effects of political indianisation gives an entirely different window onto the Kingdoms of the Himalaya, one in which culture as lived in ritual, and history as social process, rather than cultural particulars in and of themselves, come to the fore.

The chapters of Ladakh, Bhutan, Sikkim and the Kathmandu Valley Kingdoms of Nepal all follow roughly the same format, namely that of a gazetteer. The sequence is geography, trade and commerce, origins of people, history (century by century), ethnic groups today, languages, costumes, customs, state and administration, religion, monks and monasteries, festivals and pilgrimages, architecture, sculpture and painting and literature. These chapters are all amply illustrated, and the emphasis is on time, place and source rather than on any more general abstraction; but these do not necessarily appear in the form of a technical debate with other scholars. Though the sources are not fully treated and listed, and indeed in a single volume they could not be, much of the work is a useful compendium for the professional, as well as being attractive to the general reader who is prepared to support fully an interest in the Kingdoms of the Himalaya.

G.E. Clarke University of Sussex

Tsang Nyön Heruka [=Gtsang-smyon He-ru-ka], The Life of Marpa the Translator—Seeing Accomplishes All (=Sgra-bsgyur Mar-pa Lo-tsā'i Rnam-thar Mthong-ba Don-yod). Translated by the Nālandā Translation Committee under the direction of Chögyam Trungpa. (Boulder, Prajñā Press 1982) l + 267 pp.

The biography of Marpa in English? Something to celebrate! A translation which serves scholar and Dharma practitioner alike? Difficult to believe!

In the West, many scholars would agree that either you become a practitioner or a scholar; you can't be both. If you are a practitioner, you lose your "objective" viewpoint, and if you are a scholar, you lose your heartfelt magic. From that point of view, there is no hope of combining the two.

—Vajracarya Trungpa (preface)

Believeable or not, the Nālandā Translation Committee (NTC) has succeeded to a large degree in combining the two. The translation is readable enough (for anyone who will not be intimidated by unnaturalized Sanskrit and Tibetan words) and basically accurate. The scholarly apparatus is in good order. The footnotes on pages 141, 176-7, and 199-201 will be of some interest to critical scholars as they deal with chronological problems, textual criticism and the little-studied history of some especially esoteric Cakrasamvara teachings.

The critical side of the presentation could have been considerably enhanced by comparing this biography, written in 1505, with some earlier biographies of Mar-pa Chos-kyi-blo-gros (1012-1097? A.D.) that are readily available in major American libraries. In chronological order, they are:

1) Eleventh through twelfth centuries—

- A) Milarepa's (1040-1123 A.D.) biography of Marpa contained in: Bde-mchog Mkha'-'gro Snyan-brgyud (Delhi: 1973). Library of Congress Accession no. 73-902914, pp. 63-96.
- B) Gampopa's (=Sgam-po-pa, 1079-1153 A.D.) biography of Marpa together with that of Milarepa contained in all the several reprinted editions of his *Collected Works*.
- C) Zhang G.yu-brag-pa Brtson-'grus-grags-pa (1123-1193 A.D.), Writings (=Gsung Thor-bu), Tashi Jong Monastery (Palampur: 1972). LC Acc. no. 72-900813, pp. 327 ff.

II) Thirteenth century-

- A) Rgyal-thang-pa Bde-chen-rdo-rje, Dkar-brgyud Gser-phreng, Tashi Jong Monastery (Palampur: 1973). LC Acc. no. 73-904146. pp. 137-187. (This is in dbu-med script.)
- B) O-rgyan-pa Rin-chen-dpal (1230-1309), Bka'-brgyud Yid-bzhin-nor-bu-yi 'Phreng-ba, Smanrtsis Shesrig Spendzod Series no. 38 (Leh: 1972). LC Acc. no. 72-904180, pp. 106-174.

- III) Fourteenth through sixteenth centuries—
 - A) Zhwa-dmar II Mkha'-spyod-dbang-po (1350-1405), The Collected Writings (Gsung-'bum) of the Second Zhwa-dmar Mkha'-spyod-dbang-po (Gangtok: 1978). LC Acc. no. 78-903290. NOTE: This reprint of the Gsung-'bum is unfortunately lacking the biography of Marpa, which is otherwise available in the following publication: Bde-mchog Snyan-brgyud Biographies—Reproduction of a Collection of Rare Manuscripts from the Stag-sna Monastery in Ladakh, Kargyud Sungrab Nyamso Khang (Darjeeling: 1983). LC Acc. no. 84-900297, pp. 1-131.
 - B) Mon-rtse-pa Kun-dga'-dpal-ldan (1408-1475?), Dkar-brgyud Gser'-phreng, Sonam W. Tashigang (Leh: 1970). LC Acc. no. 73-912149, pp. 83-103. (This is in dbu-med script.)
 - C) 'Bri-gung-chos-rje Kun-dga'-rin-chen (1475-1527), Miscellaneous Writings (Bka'-'bum Thor bu) (Leh: 1972). LC Acc. no. 72-901803, pp. 34-41.

This treasure trove of early sources of Kargyudpa biography has been so far almost universally neglected, unfortunately. A study of them must precede any attempt at critical scholarship in the Kargyudpa studies of the future. This is a mere 'sin of omission,' and should not be taken as a criticism of the publication in question, a remarkable achievement for what it is.

The NTC may likewise be forgiven for a few in-house references in the introduction and notes. In a book such as this, coming as it does from the half-California 'hidden country' (sbas yul) of Boulder, Colorado, one would have expected much more of it. As it is, we can only applaud and encourage their evident restraint, particularly with regard to Marpa, a figure of singular and universal inspiration to Tibetans and Buddhists, not only the Kargyudpa.

Theoretically, at least, Tibetologists do not need translations. So it is only fitting that in reviewing a *translation* of the life of a *translator* it should be asked how well the translation serves its primary audience, meaning, in particular, human beings with English as their native language. The answer is, "Very well indeed!" This despite some reservations which should not be allowed to overshadow this basic assessment. Some of these reservations have to do with specific translation policies of the NTC. I have my own feelings about the advisability of using a large number of Sanskrit and Tibetan terms in the main body of an *English* translation, and of using overly-literal translations when the context alters the tone of meaning *in English*. Example: p. xlv, "The *Taming* of Milarepa" where the translation of the Tibetan word 'dul-ba would have better conveyed the real coloration of the original with something like 'training,' 'discipline' or even 'spiritual transformation.' I believe strongly in the ability of the English language to transformation.'

mit everything Tibetan literature has to say, a faith that is admittedly easily conceived and only with difficulty given birth.

If I may use the phrase "heart-felt magic" to apply to literary rather than religious communion, it is precisely here that the translators fall short of their primary goal: communication. There are short flashes of true brilliance, but particularly in the longer passages, the NTC has often failed to carry the 'narrative thrust' in a natural, flowing way. I am tempted to see this as a result of 'many cooks.' But then, Lobsang Lhalungpa's Life of Milarepa (E.P. Dutton, NY: 1977) was also a committee translation, and nevertheless remarkably readable. My own ideal translation? The only way to do it is to let the original speak for itself. Express what you hear in English. If the original is instructive, communicative, or inspiring, the translation will be likewise, naturally. Translation is the art of re-creation, not a craft. Least of all should it be an assembly-line process.

To illustrate the points made above, I would ask anyone with a copy of *The Life of Marpa* to refer to the passage beginning on the last line of page 44 and ending on page 48. For the sake of everyone else, I quote the entire passage:

I dreamt that I arrived at Śrī Parvata in the South.
In the cool shade of a grove of plakṣa trees,
On a tira corpse seat
Sat Lord Saraha, the Great Brahman.
I had never before seen such majestic brilliance.
He was flanked by two queens.
His body was adorned with charnel ground ornaments.
His joyous face was beaming.

"Welcome, my son!" he said.
Seeing the lord, I was overwhelmed with joy.
the hairs of my body stood on end, and I was moved to tears.
I circumambulated him seven times and I offered a full prostration.
I received the soles of his feet on the top of my head.
"Father, accept me with kindness," I supplicated.

He blessed my body with his.
The moment he touched his hand to the top of my head,
My body was intoxicated with undefiled bliss.
Like an elephant drunk with liquor,
There dawned an experience of immovability.

He blessed my speech with his.
With the lion's roar of emptiness,
He spoke "that without letter."
Like a dream dreamt by a mute,
There dawned an experience beyond words.

He blessed my mind with his. I realized the coemergent dharmakāya, That which neither comes nor goes. Like a human corpse left in a charnel ground, There dawned an experience of nonthought.

Then the pure speech of great bliss arose From the vase of his precious throat. With sign speech in the melody of Brahmā, He sang this vajra song which points out things as they are, The meaning of an empty sky free from clouds. Thus I heard this unborn self-utterance:

"NAMO Compassion and emptiness are inseparable.
This uninterrupted flowing innate mind
Is suchness, primordially pure.
Space is seen in intercourse with space.
Because the root resides at home,
Mind consciousness is imprisoned.
Meditating on this, subsequent thoughts
Are not patched together in the mind.
Knowing the phenomenal world is the nature of mind,
Meditation requires no further antidote.
The nature of mind cannot be thought.
Rest in this natural state.
When you see this truth, you will be liberated.
Just as a child would, watch the behavior of barbarians.
Be carefree; eat flesh; be a madman.

"Just like a fearless lion,
Let your elephant mind wander free.
See the bees hovering among the flowers.
Not viewing samsāra as wrong,
There is no such thing as attaining nirvāṇa.
This is the way of ordinary mind.
Rest in natural freshness.
Do not think of activities.
Do not cling to one side or one direction.
Look into the midst of the space of simplicity."

Going beyond the exhausting of dharmatā is the essential truth, The summit of views, mahāmudrā.
This sign meaning, which pierces to the pith of mind, I heard from the mouth of the Great Brahman.

At that instant, I awoke.

I was caught by the iron hook of this unforgettable memory. Within the dungeon of ignorant sleep,
The vision of insight-wisdom opened up
And the sun dawned in a cloudless sky,
Clearing the darkness of confusion.
I thought, "Even if I met the buddhas of the three times,"
From now on, I would have nothing to ask them."

This was a decisive experience.
Discursive thoughts were exhausted, what a wonder!
E ma! The prophecies of yidams and dākiṇīs
And the profound truth spoken by the guru,
Although I have been told not to speak of these things,
Tonight I cannot help but speak them.
Except for this very occasion,
I have never said this before.
Listen with your ears and repeat it at a later time.

I am a man who has traveled a long way
Without intimate friends and relatives.
Now, when my body becomes tired and hungry,
Son, what you have done will be in my mind.
I will not forget this; it is impressed deeply in my mind.
My heart friend, your kindness is repaid.

The lords who dwell above, the gurus,
The divine yidams who bestow siddhis,
And the dharmapālas who clear obstacles,
May all these please not scold me.
Please forgive me if there is any confusion in what I have said.

Even those who know not a single word of Tibetan will have noticed several logically obvious mistakes, that is, assuming that the original is intelligible. These do not concern me so much as that the overall feeling of the Tibetan is lost. I offer my own translation with no special claims to its superiority (Tibetan readers should go directly to the Tibetan text printed in the Addendum at the end of this review), but yet without apologies. Marpa is singing one of those spontaneous songs (for which Milarepa is most famous) on the subject of his dream meeting with Saraha. This dream he obviously viewed as being symbolic of a decisive phase in his spiritual development. In Tibet, Saraha is remembered as the grandfather of the tantric sages and one of the very few persons in Buddhist history capable of instant (cig-car) Buddhahood. Bear this in mind. The tone should be, in English as it is in Tibetan, deeply and sincerely devotional; also, very straightforward.

I dreamed I went south to Shree Parvata where in the shade of a lagsha tree using a human corpse for his seat was the Great Brahmin Saraha, his face of a brilliance such as I had never seen. Two ladies were seated to either side. Dressed in the stuff of graveyards, he smiled a bright smile and asked me, "Have you had a pleasant journey, my son?"

It was difficult, impossible, to look at him. My hair stood on end as the tears came out. I circled seven times and bowed down before him. As I took the soles of his feet on my head I prayed, "Father, accept me with compassion."

Then my body was blessed by his Buddhabody,
The mere touch of his hand on the top of my head
made my body pure and drunk with bliss.
Like an elephant drunk with wine,
an unshakeable inner experience arose.

My speech was blessed by his Buddhaspeech. With the lion's roar of Voidness, he explained the meaning of the Wordless. Like a mute man dreaming a dream, an unspeakable inner experience arose.

My mind was blessed by his Buddhamind. I realized the meaning of the Dharmabody that was there all along, without coming or going and, like an insensate corpse in the cemetary, an unthinkable inner experience arose.

Then his voice made of pure Great Bliss made the symbolic sounds of celestrial music emerge from the vase of jewelled song, a Vajra Song pointing to Reality (the meaning of Voidness? — a cloudless sky). I heard these words, unborn sounds produced by sound:

"Praise to Voidness and Compassion inseparable! I see in a ceaseless stream the primordial Mind, the eternally pure actuality— Space embracing space.

"Though it stays in a house of grass,* the thoughts confine consciousness to prison walls. Outward knowledge and meditation have no way to settle down together in Mind. Know the world of appearances as of the nature of Mind. Fixing up antidotes is no meditation. The nature of Mind is no way of thinking. So settle in in the unfixed sphere.

"If you divine the significance of that, you are free. So consider the activities of children and laundrymen. Look to the cannibals and crazy people, as you like.

"Like a lion lacking in pride, put the elephant of Mind above you. Consider the bees among the flowers.

^{*} This apparently alludes to the sutra image of the vicious circle of sangsara as a house of reeds,' something much less stable and substantial than it initially appears to be. The reading is, however, unsure.

Don't look for what's wrong with the vicious circle. Nirvana is not something to be obtained.

As for the usual patterns of everyday thoughts, settle them into the unfixed Mind in itself. You won't find it in the business world. It doesn't stay in parts or particular directions. Look to the centre of self-contained space. Your essential purpose is to be brought to the place where the dharmas are exhausted, the height beyond all heights of vision—The Supreme Seal.

"Unravel these intentional, symbolic words piercing the vital points of Mind."

These words I heard from the Great Brahmin's lips.

Then I awakened immediately from sleep and hooked his words securely in my memory. In the dark cave of ignorant sleep the skylight of knowing Total Knowledge opened up and, like the sun rising in a cloudless sky, the pitch dark of confusion dissolved and went clear. "If I met the Buddhas of all eternity, there would be nothing to ask them," I thought. An inner experience of spiritual determination arose.

The courses of Buddhamind are good! Incredible!
The meaning of prophecies of Tutelaries and Skywalkers and the profound pronouncements of the Guru are said to be incapable of expression.
Yet, tonight there was no way not to speak.
This one time only excepted,
I have never known such things to be told in words.
Listen, if they be repeated in the future.
I am a man far away, a trace from the past.
I have no close acquaintances, no friends . . .

When the body is tired and hungry, do not forget that whatever is done, my sons, is in Mind. Impress this firmly on your thoughts: It is the grace of the Guru that pierces sangsara, my heart-close friends!

The Lord Guru who abides above me, the divine Tutelaries who grant the achievements, the Dharma Protectors who clear away obstructions . . . I pray they will not punish me, a human being, but have patience if I have caused any confusion.

I must confess in closing a certain amount of jealousy in the fact that the NTC has accomplished something I would like to have done myself, so per-

haps I am just suffering from 'sour grapes.' Three new and potentially very valuable translations are promised for the near future. They are:

- 1) Dbang-phyug-rgyal-mtshan's biography of Tilopa.
- 2) Padma-dkar-po's History of Buddhism (Chos-'byung).
- 3) Tārānātha's History of the 'Seven Injunctions' (Bka'-babs-bdun-ldan). I can only sit in awe and wish them the best in the very difficult tasks they have undertaken. I hope that this translation of Marpa's biography, acceptable as it may be, will find a more polished second edition. Marpa the Translator deserves it.

Dan Martin Indiana University

ADDENDUM

Please note that a very similar version of the passage translated by the NTC, which I have quoted above, had previously appeared in *Rain of Wisdom* (Boulder: 1980), pp. 134-7.

The Tibetan text as reproduced below is from a separately published extract included in the *Gdams-ngag Mdzod* as it was published by Lama Ngodrup & Sherab Drimey (Paro: 1979), vol. VII, pp. 64.2 to 66.2. Kongsprul gives the words spoken by Saraha to Marpa an added title:

Phyag-rgya-chen-po Yid-la Mi Byed-pa Snying-po Don-gyi Gdams-ngag Yi-ge Bzhi-pa'i Don Rdo-rje'i Mgur-du Bzhengs-pa

This is further explained in the added colophon and I render freely:

The Meaning of the 'Four Statements,' Precepts of the Authentic Innermost Significance of the Great Seal (Mahāmudrā) Put into Vajra Song.

The 'Four Statements' by the dream Saraha are considered to be a summation of Mahāmudrā teachings. Kong-sprul, in his colophon, gives the following correspondences for these 'Four Statements.'

- First—Dharmabody (Chos-kyi Sku). Determining the basic facts of Mind (Sems-kyi gzhi-rtsa bcad).
- Second—Complete Assets Body (Longs-spyod Rdzogs Sku). Demonstrating the methods of laying Mind to rest (Sems-kyi bzhag thabs bstan).
- Third—Emanation Body (Sprul-pa'i Sku). Avoiding the turnoffs (from the Path) of Mind (Sems-kyi gol-sa spong).
- Fourth—Substantial Identity Body (Ngo-bo-nyid Sku). Demonstrating the expedients of Mind (Sems-kyi lam-khyer bstan).

Although this is not the place for a full study on the subject, I would at least like to point out for those interested two short texts concerned with the 'Four Statements.'

- 1) A three folio beginning of a text with the title *Phyag-rgya chen-po Yi-ge Bzhi-pa'i Gdams-pa*, reproduced in *Rare Dkar-brgyud-pa Texts from the Library of Ri-bo-che Rje-drung of Padma-bkod* (Tibetan Nyingmapa Monastery, Tezu, Arunachal Pradesh, India: 1974), pp. 77 to 82. (Note that the folio reproduced on pp. 83-84 is from an unidentified text and the folios reproduced on pp. 85-97 continue the text started on pp. 215-222). Even though the colophon is missing, we know, thanks to the lineage of teachers given on pp. 78-80, that this text is by a disciple of Rgod-tshang-ras-pa Snatshogs-rang-grol (1494-1570 A.D.), and therefore roughly late sixteenth century.
- 2) A text entitled Phyag-rgya-chen-po Yi-ge Bzhi-pa'i Dgongs Don Snying-por Dril-ba Byin-rlabs Bum Bzang by Rtse-le Rgod-tshang-pa Padma-legs-grub, alias Sna-tshogs-rang-grol (born 1608 and died after 1678; he is not to be confused with the above-mentioned sixteenth-century Sna-tshogs-rang-grol, despite the similarity of their names). Found in his Complete Works (Mgon-po-tshe-brtan, Palace Monastery, Gangtok: 1979), vol. IV, pp. 139-154.

All this is offered to explain the divergent reading *yi-ge bzhi-pa* in line 12 of the text, and as material toward the future interpretation of the words of the dream Saraha.

I have given variant readings which substantially alter the meaning from four sources:

- A: A woodblock print of 74 folios with no added colophon. Marginal title: *Mar-pa* (page no.). Folios 17 verso (line 3) to 18 verso (line 3). Personal copy.
- B: Bka'-brgyud Gser-'phreng Rgyas-pa (Rdzong-khul Tradition), Kargyud Sungrab Nyamso Khang (Darjeeling: 1982). Vol. l, pp. 230.3-232.6. This represents a manuscript copy from a very early woodblock print.
- C: A modern Indian reprint in *pothi* style in 84 folios with no printing information given. Marginal title: *nga* (page no.). This represents a manuscript copy (or tracing) of a woodblock-printed original made in Bzang-yul (in the G.yor-po area of Lho-kha in South Tibet) by a monk named Sangs-rgyas-dbang-po. Pp. 41.4 to 43.7.
- D: A retraced reproduction of the late nineteenth century Bstan-rgyas-gling woodblock print (135 folios). From Bka'-brgyud-pa Hagiographies compiled by the late Khams-sprul Don-brgyud-nyi-ma (Sungrab Nyamso Gyunphel Parkhang; Tashijong, Falampur: 1972), vol. l, pp. 274.6 to 278.4.

Windisch-Graetz, Stephanie & Ghislaine zu, Himalayan Kingdoms: Gods, People & the Arts, (Lucerne, Reich Verlag AG, 1981), pp. 184.

A Viennese mother-daughter writer-photographer team are the authors of this large format book which probably should have been titled Jewels of the Himalayas. Although the land, places and peoples of Kashmir, Ladakh, Tibet (represented by Tibetans living in Kathmandu, Nepal) and Nepal are strikingly documented, it is the jewelry that is the primary focus of the book. The full color photographs of the jewelry being worn 'in the field' are not only fine documents of the total effect that the jewelry conveys in its full context (as opposed to being set out in a case in a museum), but the photographs are also very impressive artistic works in themselves. Often there are several views of an ensemble, including extreme close-ups, which allow a nearly complete view of not only the jewelry, but also how the jewelry and costume integrate to create a complete presentation of personal identity, regional origin and cultural membership.

Tibetan cultural influence dominates, with the most striking sections of the book being of Ladakh, its people, monasteries, deities, and incredible landscape; and of the Tibetans as they appear in Kathmandu, Nepal. The latter contains several pages of close-up views of gold ga'u (charm boxes) set with carved turquoises, strung on necklaces of large red corals and gzi (gzi/dzi/tzi) beads interspersed with multi-strands of pearls. These are the best depictions of the Lhasa style of jewelry in print.

This book also presents a wealth of other ethnic cultural traditions. It begins with Kashmir and shows Muslim influences in Bukawa and Ghujar jewelry ensembles. The Ghujar silver necklaces shown contain distinctly Muslim design elements such as triangular finials for multi-strand stringings of spacer bars, each with pendant chain dangles and a large, round plaque chased with intricate patterns, set with stones or glass jewels and fringed with chain dangles, each ending in a small pendant (No. 15). Rings, bracelets, earrings, nose ornament, coin necklace, and glass bead multi-strand choker with silver beads and spacers, complete the ensemble (No. 17).

Also pictured are women of Baltistan, the Baltis, with their large ornate filigree crescent-shaped silver earrings (Nos. 24, 25). A mixture of influences can be seen in the ornaments of the Chigtani, a Shiite Muslim group living in western Ladakh (Nos. 35-37). In addition to Ladakhi-style silver filigree ga'u set with turquoises, the women also wear necklaces of coral, turquoise and agate beads. The charm boxes are not worn in necklaces. Instead, they are sewn to a head piece which trails down the back. They also are sewn to cloth flaps which are attached to each shoulder and hang down over the upper arm. Also attached to these flaps are Kashmir-style amulet tubes of silver within which are held verses from the Koran, used for their amuletic power. A Ladakhi-style brass incised disc is used as a fastener for the shoulder jewelry piece; traditions from Tibet, Ladakh, and Kashmir are all combined in one distinctive costume.

One photograph of a woman from Karakorum on the Pakistani border is quite extraordinary (Nos. 21-22). The woman is a Drukpa ('Brug-pa) Buddhist and is ". . . reported to be a sorceress" (p. 55). Her costume and jewelry are expressive of the amuletic powers of adornment. It features a leather sign-board kind of arrangement, worn on the chest, which has a row of four large discs of brass decorated with incised and sawn out open work patterns, below which are double rows of brass British Army buttons. A double row of white glass buttons completes the decoration of the flap. Similar copper discs or plaques are fastened to each shoulder with cascades of red glass (or possibly red coral) and yellow glass (or amber) beads intermixed, each ending in a cowrie shell. Her hair is worn in many braids, each finished off with a brass bell. She also wears many strands of red and vellow beads as a choker. Very long pearl strands hang down from the ears with amber, coral and turquoise beads (or their simulants) at the bottom of the loop. This is a common style in Ladakh, but here it is done in an exaggerated length. A large copper-silver alloy disc protrudes from under the chest ornament flap, a device and symbol of her oracular power. She also wears rings, bracelets, a copper ga'u, and a cloth head-piece with red corals and ambers sewn on in a manner similar to the Ladakhi perak. To the top of this she has pinned some red flowers.

The section on Ladakh contains many fine pictures of the distinctive jewelry of this region. The most spectacular is the perak, a cloth-covered leather triangle which covers the head and comes to a point in the front, shading the forehead. Onto the top are sewn rows of turquoise beads and in the center a ga'u is attached. Many examples are pictured, from modest ones with a single silver ga'u and only a few rows of turquoises (No. 31), to full-blown versions with gold filigree ga'u set with gems and extending down the back almost to the waist; an additional side panel has long lines of coral beads with turquoises interspaced (Nos. 64-8). The richer ladies wear large red coral and turquoise beads strung with multiple strands of small baroque pearls, from which hangs a gold ga'u faced with filigree and set with fine turquoises and red glass gems. The poorer women wear silver ga'u, often five to ten smaller ones strung into orange coral strands and worn with other coral strands interspaced with silver dangles and spacers of a design peculiar to Ladakh (Nos. 59, 62). Also shown is the silver chatelaine which is hooked onto the right front of the garment next to, and partially overlapped by, the necklaces and charm boxes (No. 57). Originally, it was used to hold a set of tools such as an ear spoon, nail cleaning pick, tweezers, scissors, etc., probably originating in Central Asia, but this has evolved into a purely decorative ornament, usually done now as multiple chains hung in three tiers (Nos. 61, 77).

The close-up pictures of Lhasa style ga'u as worn by the Tibetan women living around Bodhnath, outside of Kathmandu, are next featured. This style of charm box is characterized by its large size, with intricate gold fili-

gree or carved and chased gold floral motifs encrusting the face, which is set with carved turquoise pieces representing flaming jewels. Only the most intense blue stones are used. Imitation diamonds, rubies and emeralds and sometimes rows of pearls set in as borders are utilized as well (Nos. 85, 88-91). The normally square shape of the box itself is often curved to give a star-like appearance to the pointed corners, with the triangular tabs extending from the curved sides, each one also faced with turquoises, set-in like mosaic (Nos. 88, 90). The overall effect, when worn strung from a rope of multi-strands of pearls interspaced with the large, round red corals and the 'tiger striped' round gzi beads, is of an overwhelming richness. When it is worn with an additional large necklace of pearls, gzi and red coral balls which extends below the ga'u, and a shorter supporting strand strung into the top of the ga'u in order to give the larger strand a rounded shape as it hangs, the impression is redoubled. On top of all this, the chatelaine (Tibetan: khru-khru), which is done in silver elsewhere, is made mostly of pearls and gzi in Lhasa style, with tiers either hung from ornate gold pieces set with stones (Nos. 85, 92), or from jade carvings from China with smaller jade pieces interspersed, carved jade dangles ending the ropes of pearls (No. 89). One can also infer from these pictures which gzi beads are most esteemed by their owners by the position they take in these ornaments. The round gzi with tiger stripes are given prime position in the main strands which are strung through the suspension tube of the ga'u and the necklace which extends below it (No. 88). If one does not possess a full set of round gzi, the long oval beads with two, four and six 'eyes' (Tibetan: mig) are utilized on the main strand (No. 89), with the earth-door/sky-door (Tibetan: sa-sgo gnam-sgo, a circle on one side, a square on the other) and the smaller gzi with zig-zag patterns being used in the chatelaine (also, small two-eyed and small three-eyed gzi) as well as in the smaller suspension strand (Nos. 88. 91. 92).

Also shown in this section are an ornamented saddle (No. 97), fire starting kit (No. 96), a bracelet of silver (No. 95), and a gold earring set with a turquoise called a-long, the most common style of earring worn in Tibet. Also in this section are shown Sherpa women with Nepali-influenced ornaments (No. 99), such as a large gold corolla earring set with a turquoise. and a multi-strand silver chain belt showing both Nepali and Tibetan nomadic influences in the design (No. 100). A Lhasa noblewoman's hair ornaments made of three tiers of carved turquoises set in gold, which are worn suspended from a strap over the head (to sit at either side of the head in front of the ears), are pictured modeled by a beautiful Nepali woman (No. 101). This is the only posed shot in the book, but is nevertheless a striking picture. These ornaments are rarely worn today, as they are part of an ensemble that included a cloth-covered frame to which many braids of hair were attached, causing the whole construction to extend out around the head. The frames themselves were heavily encrusted with coral and turquoise beads sewn on in a row.

The last section on Nepal shows the intricately-worked gold ornaments made by the Newaris of Kathmandu. Here the authors happened upon a ceremony in which prepubescent girls are married to the god Narajan. The daughters of rich families, these girls are shown dressed in rich silk brocades and adorned with gold jewelry, which are the treasured wealth of the family. They wear collars of gold plates sewn to a velvet backing which are pierced with open work and raised from the back to depict a wealth of floral motifs swirling in giddy profusion (Nos. 122, 123, 126). Similarly, gold plates are sewn to a velvet backing to form a diadem with a central strip which travels from the forehead across the top of the head to the back; a crescent moon hangs from the juncture in front, down onto the forehead (Nos. 121-123). Hair ornaments in the form of leaves and flowers, some set with stones, adorn a young girl celebrating a ceremony marking her first menstruation. She wears the tik-mah gold plaque collar which is fringed with date-shaped green glass beads. A gold neck chain and gilded bronze torque complete the outfit (No. 122). Also pictured in the Nepal section are sadhu mendicants at Pashupatinath, the complex of shrines to Shiva on the banks of the Bagmati, Nepal's Ganges. This site of pilgrimage also attracts from all over India ascetics who, with their emaciated bodies covered in ashes, adorn themselves with the seed of Elaeocarpus janitus, called rudrākṣa. One of the sadhus pictured has made himself a kind of top hat by twining together the coils of a long strand of rudrāksa seeds (No. 120).

The writing of Himalayan Kingdoms was done by Ghislaine zu Windisch-Graetz, and reflects her background in archaeological research. She has done an admirable job of providing background information on the history and religion of the region. The level of writing is high, considering the usual coffeetable-book glosses, and becomes especially interesting when she gives impressionistic accounts of the authors' travels in collecting the visual material for this book. Unfortunately, rarely do the text and the photography mesh as they do where the initiation of the young Nepali girls is described and the photos are used to illustrate the event. Often, one feels that the author has been carried away by her own enthusiasms for the mysteries of the East and included material that is of only tangential interest. Frequently, topics central to the understanding of the photos are excluded as being outside the scope of the book (p. 111): "Unfortunately, it is not possible in a work of this scope to undertake a complete study of the ornaments worn by the men and women of Tibet. The country is immense, with numerous ethnic groups and ornaments of a multiple variety." More on this diversity of Tibetan ornaments could have been included, in lieu of a complete description.

One of the more confused sections is on the 'mystical' properties of stones. Most of the beliefs presented appear to be Islamic traditions, such as the following (p. 29): "Turquoise has always been and continues to be, much valued in the East as a talisman, a function for which is to be engraved with a text from the Koran. The clergy held it in particular esteem

since they believed it increased the faculty of premonitions." It would have been more appropriate to cite the beliefs of the Buddhist traditions concerning turquoise, since most (almost all) of the peoples pictured wearing turquoise in this book are Buddhists. Other beliefs concerning precious stones are described in a mixture of mystical, astrological and scientific terms. It is difficult to tell if the author wishes us to interpret these statements in a literal and scientific sense or in a metaphorical or 'mystical' way. What are we to make of claims for diamonds glowing in the dark after being rubbed with wool or leather? What is the significance of different stones becoming phosphorescent after heating or acquiring electro-static charges? (p. 29) The author is excessively zealous in her presentation, appearing more interested in convincing the reader than in giving a coherent account of the different traditions. One feels that the author is a believer, trying to maintain a Western, objective attitude and vocabulary, but failing to do so. One would have preferred, instead, an account of the beliefs of those peoples actually pictured concerning the stones they are wearing.

Serious inaccuracies in the text result from the lack of awareness of the use of simulations in the jewelry. This is especially evident in the Tibetan jewelry. The author asserts that the gold ga'u are set with diamonds, rubies and sapphires. Actually, these are almost certainly glass imitations. This is also true of many of the pearls which are strung between the large red corals and gzi beads. While many are genuine, many are a high quality imitation which used to sell in Lhasa for nearly as much as the real ones. The hanging ornaments (based on the chatelaine), which are now frequently strung with jade, pearls and gzi beads, also use red and green glass beads which the author describes on page 129 as "... white pearls ... mixed with ruby or emerald balls . . ." This kind of error can be very misleading. One might assume that the actual value of this jewelry lies in the 'precious' stones, whereas the gzi and red coral of these necklaces are the really expensive components. Similarly, in the gold ga'u, the 'diamonds' and 'rubies' and 'emeralds' are inexpensive simulations and they are the matched sets of very intense blue turquoise pieces and, of course, the gold weight which make up its principle value.

In only one photograph (No. 94) are the materials of a traditional coral and amber necklace identified as plastic imitations. In a photo of a Sherpa woman (No. 99), we are told that she has combined a gold and turquoise ornament, "with refreshing nonchalance . . . with a necklace of plastic pearls." In the same picture we can see that she has also combined real coral and turquoise beads with what appear to be imitation (glass) gzi beads. This points up a problem with methodology in making a book like this. Even when one has obtained extremely interesting photographic documents in the field, one cannot always be sure of what one has captured once one has returned to the West and cannot question the subjects further. And, even if one could, often these reports will be inaccurate, especially if the question is: "Are these pearls real? Are those diamonds set into your

ga'u?" The answer is likely to be in the affirmative regardless of the true facts. And then there are the borderline cases, such as photograph No. 63. "This beautiful pendant, a heart-shaped turquoise set in gold with small rubies, belongs to an emigré Tibetan woman from Lhasa, who brought the piece with her from her homeland." (p. 96) One looks at the photograph and notices that several of the rubies that surround the turquoise have fallen out. One hopes that the lost rubies are glass; but the rubies could very well be Burmese rubies that were traded into Lhasa. They were certainly available to the nobility. One simply cannot tell from the picture. And then there is the case of a very interesting stone not being identified. Although it is impossible to positively identify from the photograph alone, it appears that there are sapphires from the Zanskar (Zangs-dkar) mine in Ladakh that have been set into the gold ornaments of a Tara statue (No. 55), along with corals and turquoises. The shrine is in Simchung, the abbot superior's residence of Spitug (Nos. 52-55).

Although the book *Himalayan Kingdoms* is a fascinating and beautiful overview, and contains a wealth of general information, a second book could be made from just the photographs with a new and more specific text to accompany them. If the research could be limited to account simply for the splendid jewelry, its uses and traditions, serious students of traditional adornments would find it a truly priceless resource.

David Ebbinghouse Bloomington

The Tibet Society

MINUTES

The Tibet Society's Annual Membership Meeting March 23, 1984

Monroe Room East, Washington Hilton Hotel, Washington, D.C. March 23, 1984

The meeting was called to order by the President, Prof. Thubten Jigme Norbu, at 8:20 p.m. Mr. Robert G. Service was appointed secretary for the meeting. Prof. Norbu reported that the Secretary-Treasurer had resigned and that Ms. Janet Olsen was now handling office work in Bloomington. Drs. Elliot Sperling and Denys Voaden were appointed to count the ballots for the Board of Director's election.

The financial report was presented by Dr. Christopher I. Beckwith. He noted that the Society was in a sound financial position. Printing costs and postage remained the largest items of expenditure. He pointed out that the cost of Volume 2 of the *Journal*, about \$3,000, would appear on the 1984 Statement.

Following the financial report, Dr. Beckwith, in his capacity as editor of the Journal, delivered the Report of the Publications Committee. He announced that Volume 2 of the Journal had just been published. The Newsletter continues to appear regularly. Volume 3 of the Journal is expected out this summer. There is a backlog of good material. At present, the only problems faced by the Journal are a lack of money for expansion and a shortage of adequate editorial assistance. The Occasional Papers Series has two manuscripts awaiting publication, both of them translations from the Russian. These are Roerich's The Tibetan Language and a new, improved translation of Vostrikov's Tibetan Historical Literature. Unfortunately, there are no funds to cover the cost of publishing either work at present. Prof. Beckwith called special attention to the inclusion of the Brief Communications feature in the Journal and expressed the hope that it would grow into a lively forum for the exchange of information and ideas con-